

MIGRATION RESEARCH LEADERS SYNDICATE  
IN SUPPORT OF THE GLOBAL COMPACT ON MIGRATION

# **A Comparative Thematic Mapping of Global Migration Initiatives:**

Lessons learned towards a Global Compact  
for safe, orderly and regular migration



International Organization for Migration  
The UN Migration Agency

The opinions expressed in the report are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the International Organization for Migration (IOM). The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout the report do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of IOM concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning its frontiers or boundaries.

IOM is committed to the principle that humane and orderly migration benefits migrants and society. As an intergovernmental organization, IOM acts with its partners in the international community to: assist in meeting the operational challenges of migration; advance understanding of migration issues; encourage social and economic development through migration; and uphold the human dignity and well-being of migrants.

Publisher: International Organization for Migration  
17 route des Morillons  
P.O. Box 17  
1211 Geneva 19  
Switzerland  
Tel: + 41 22 717 91 11  
Fax: + 41 22 798 61 50  
E-mail: [hq@iom.int](mailto:hq@iom.int)  
Internet: [www.iom.int](http://www.iom.int)

---

© 2017 International Organization for Migration (IOM)

---

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior written permission of the publisher.

MIGRATION RESEARCH LEADERS SYNDICATE  
IN SUPPORT OF THE GLOBAL COMPACT ON MIGRATION

---

# **A Comparative Thematic Mapping of Global Migration Initiatives:**

Lessons learned towards a Global Compact  
for safe, orderly and regular migration

Céline Bauloz



International Organization for Migration

The UN Migration Agency





# Table of contents

<b>Executive summary .....</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>1. Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2. Global migration governance: An overview .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>3. Global migration initiatives: A comparative thematic mapping .....</b>	<b>7</b>
3.1. Minimizing the negative aspects of migration: Addressing the drivers of forced and irregular migration .....	7
3.2. Acknowledging and strengthening the positive effects of migration .....	8
3.3. Protecting migrants' rights and ensuring their well-being .....	10
<b>4. Lessons learned for the way forward .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Annexes .....</b>	<b>15</b>
Annex I: List of global and regional migration initiatives and other processes.....	15
Annex II: Summary of key thematic convergences, trends and tension points .....	16





## Executive summary

This paper has been commissioned by the International Organization for Migration to inform and assist the Organization in its role in servicing the intergovernmental negotiations towards a global compact for safe, orderly and regular migration following the adoption of the New York Declaration for Refugees and Migrants by the United Nations General Assembly in September 2016. Its objective is to review issues, themes and recommendations/proposals made by previous global migration initiatives and critically analyse areas of convergence and key tension points over time.

With that view, the paper provides a comparative thematic mapping structured along three main thematic clusters common to global migration initiatives: (a) minimizing the negative aspects of migration by addressing the drivers and consequences of forced and irregular migration, and combating smuggling and trafficking; (b) acknowledging and strengthening the positive effects of migration; and (c) protecting migrants' rights and ensuring their well-being. By then, identifying the major sub-thematic issues included in these thematic clusters, the analysis highlights that global migration initiatives converge on a substantial number of sub-thematic issues. Divergences between them either denote thematic trends that have emerged over time or more inherent tension points on which agreement is not yet achieved, that is, the opening up of more legal avenues for migration, the consideration of low-skilled labour migration outside temporary migration policies and the ratification of the 1990 International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families. It concludes on the need for more knowledge-based research on the subject and on the lack of clear objectives and action plans for these initiatives calling for more evidence-based research.







# 1

## Introduction

On 19 September 2016, the United Nations General Assembly adopted the New York Declaration for Refugees and Migrants addressing the question of large movements of refugees and migrants.<sup>1</sup> Reaffirming their commitments for both refugees and migrants, Member States agreed to the elaboration of two global compacts to be adopted in 2018: (a) global compact on refugees; and (b) global compact for safe, orderly and regular migration. While the former is to be developed and initiated by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), the latter is to be elaborated through a process of intergovernmental negotiations supported by the Secretary-General, and jointly serviced by the UN Secretariat, providing capacity and support, and the International Organization for Migration (IOM) for technical and policy expertise.<sup>2</sup>

It is against this background that this paper has been commissioned by IOM. In light of the objectives for the global compact to “make an important contribution to global governance” and “deal with all aspects of international migration”,<sup>3</sup> this paper more specifically reviews issues, themes and recommendations/proposals made by previous global migration initiatives. For so doing, it focuses on multilateral initiatives at the international and, to a certain extent, regional levels and critically analyses areas of convergence and key tension points over time.

---

1 United Nations General Assembly, New York Declaration for Refugees and Migrants, Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 19 September 2016 (A/RES/71/1), 3 October 2016.

2 Ibid., Annex II, para. 12.

3 Ibid., Annex II, para. 2.



## Global migration governance: An overview

Governance is a multifaceted notion which, as defined by the Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM), “[i]n the domain of international migration, [...] assumes a variety of forms, including the migration policies and programmes of individual countries, interstate discussions and agreements, multilateral fora and consultative processes, the activities of international organizations, as well as the laws and norms [...]”.<sup>4</sup> Beyond laws and norms, Table 1 summarizes the main initiatives, processes, agreements and declarations devoted or relevant to migration.

**Table 1:** Timeline of main multilateral initiatives, processes, agreements and declarations devoted or relevant to migration<sup>5</sup>

<b>1985</b>	Launch of the Intergovernmental Consultations on Migration, Asylum and Refugees
<b>1990</b>	Creation of the Central American Commission of Migration Directors (Comisión Centroamericana de Directores de Migración)
<b>1993</b>	Launch of the Budapest Process
<b>1994</b>	Cairo International Conference on Population and Development
<b>1996</b>	Launch of the Regional Conference on Migration (Puebla Process) Launch of the Inter-Governmental Asia-Pacific Consultations on Refugees, Displaced Persons and Migrants Launch of the Pacific Immigration Directors’ Conference Inclusion of Mode 4 commitments (on the movement of natural persons) under the Third Protocol to the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS)
<b>1998</b>	Launch of the International Migration Policy Programme
<b>1999</b>	Appointment of a Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights of Migrants by the UN Commission on Human Rights
<b>2000</b>	Launch of the Hague Process on Refugees and Migration Launch of the Migration Dialogue for Southern Africa Launch of the South American Conference on Migration (Lima Process) Adoption of the United Nations Millennium Declaration (Millennium Development Goals)

<sup>4</sup> Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM), *Migration in an Interconnected World: New Directions for Action*, Report of the Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM, Switzerland, 2005), p. 65.

<sup>5</sup> As the focus of this timeline is on migration generally, it does not encompass – and is without prejudice to – other more specific initiatives, including initiatives relating to refugees per se, such as UNHCR ones or the Conference of the Commonwealth of Independent States (1996–2005).

<b>2001</b>	Creation of the Berne Initiative Launch of the IOM International Dialogue on Migration (IDM) Launch of the Cross-Border Cooperation Process (Söderköping Process) Launch of the Migration Dialogue for West Africa Process
<b>2002</b>	Launch of the Coordination meeting on International Migration, United Nations Population Division of the Department of Economic and Social Affairs Launch of the Regional Ministerial Conference on Migration in the Western Mediterranean (5+5 Dialogue) Launch of the Bali Process on People Smuggling, Trafficking in Persons and Related Transnational Crime Adoption of the Migration Working Group's Report to the Secretary-General (Doyle Report)
<b>2003</b>	Establishment of the Global Commission on International Migration Establishment of the Geneva Migration Group Launch of the Mediterranean Transit Migration Dialogue Launch of the Ministerial Consultation on Overseas Employment and Contractual Labour for Countries of Origin in Asia (Colombo Process) Launch of the Migration, Asylum, Refugees Regional Initiative
<b>2004</b>	Adoption of the non-binding International Labour Organization (ILO) "Report VII: Towards a Fair Deal for Migrant Workers in the Global Economy", International Labour Conference Adoption of the non-binding Berne Initiative, International Agenda for Migration Management
<b>2006</b>	Establishment of the Global Migration Group (GMG) (formerly the Geneva Migration Group) First High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development (2006 HLD) Appointment of a Special Representative of the Secretary-General for International Migration and Development by the UN Secretary-General Launch of the Euro-African Dialogue on Migration and Development (Rabat Process) Adoption of the non-binding ILO Multilateral Framework on Labour Migration
<b>2007</b>	Launch of the Global Forum on Migration and Development (GFMD)
<b>2008</b>	Launch of the Intergovernmental Authority on Development – Regional Consultative Process on Migration Launch of the Ministerial Consultations on Overseas Employment and Contractual Labour for Countries of Origin and Destination in Asia (Abu Dhabi Dialogue)
<b>2011</b>	Launch of the Global Diaspora Forum Launch of the Eastern Partnership Panel on Migration and Asylum (incorporating the Söderköping Process) Adoption of the Istanbul Declaration and Programme of Action for the Least Developed Countries, Fourth UN Conference of the Least Developed Countries
<b>2012</b>	UN Conference on Sustainable Development (Rio+20) Launch of the Nansen Initiative on Disaster-Induced Cross-Border Displacement Launch of the Migration Dialogue for Central African States Adoption of the non-binding IOM Migration Crisis Operational Framework (MCOF)
<b>2013</b>	Second High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development (2013 HLD) Launch of the Almaty Process on Refugee Protection and International Migration Launch of the Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA) Regional Consultative Process (Migration Dialogue for COMESA Member States)

<b>2014</b>	<p>Launch of the Migrants in Countries in Crisis (MICIC) Initiative</p> <p>Launch of the Mayoral Forum on Human Mobility, Migration and Development</p> <p>Adoption of the non-binding report, “Fair Migration: Setting an ILO Agenda”, International Labour Conference</p> <p>Adoption of the non-binding SIDS Accelerated Modalities of Action Pathway (SAMOA Pathway)</p>
<b>2015</b>	<p>Launch of the Intra-Regional Forum on Migration in Africa (Pan-African Forum)</p> <p>Launch of the Arab Regional Consultative Process</p> <p>Adoption of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development by the UN General Assembly</p> <p>Adoption of the Migration Governance Framework by the IOM Council</p> <p>Adoption of the Addis Ababa Action Agenda on Financing for Development</p> <p>Adoption of the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction, Third UN World Conference on Disaster Risk Reduction</p> <p>Adoption of the Paris Agreement on Climate Change</p> <p>Adoption of the non-binding Nansen Initiative’s Agenda for the Protection of Cross-Border Displaced Persons in the Context of Disasters and Climate Change</p>
<b>2016</b>	<p>World Humanitarian Summit and launch of the Grand Bargain</p> <p>Adoption of the New Urban Agenda, UN Conference on Housing and Sustainable Development (Habitat III)</p> <p>Adoption of the non-binding MICIC Initiative’s Guidelines to Protect Migrants in Countries Experiencing Conflict or Natural Disasters</p> <p>Adoption of the New York Declaration for Refugees and Migrants, UN Summit for Refugees and Migrants</p>

As apparent in this timeline, initiatives and other processes relevant to migration can be either migration-specific or of a broader thematic character, as well as global or regional.<sup>6</sup> This paper focuses on nine global intergovernmental initiatives that have made a substantial contribution to the development of global migration governance: (a) Berne Initiative, which adopted the International Agenda for Migration Management (IAMM) in 2004;<sup>7</sup> (b) annual meetings of the IDM, launched in 2001; (c) 2002 Doyle Report;<sup>8</sup> (d) GCIM, established in 2003 and which adopted a report on *Migration in an Interconnected World: New Directions for Action* in 2005;<sup>9</sup> (e) GMG, created in 2006; (f) 2006 First High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development (2006 HLD); (g) 2013 Second High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development (2013 HLD);<sup>10</sup> (h) GFMD, launched in 2007; and (i) 2016 UN Summit for Refugees and Migrants, which adopted the New York Declaration.

<sup>6</sup> For a list of global and regional migration initiatives and other processes building on the list provided in the timeline, see Annex I.

<sup>7</sup> Berne Initiative, *International Agenda for Migration Management* (IOM and the Federal Office for Migration, Switzerland, 2005).

<sup>8</sup> Migration Working Group, *Report to the Secretary-General on Migration*, Doyle Report, 20 December 2002.

<sup>9</sup> GCIM, 2005.

<sup>10</sup> UN General Assembly, *Summary of the High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development*, Note by the President of the General Assembly, A/61/515, 13 October 2006 (2006 HLD); and UN General Assembly, *Declaration of the High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development*, A/68/L.5, 1 October 2013 (2013 HLD).



# Global migration initiatives: A comparative thematic mapping

Migration is commonly acknowledged as a multidimensional and complex phenomenon, involving countries of origin, transit and destination, as well as migrants themselves. This transpires in the multifaceted approach to migration followed by all nine global migration initiatives on which this paper focuses and which can be schematically conceptualized along three main thematic clusters: (a) minimizing the negative aspects of migration by addressing the drivers and consequences of displacement and irregular migration; (b) acknowledging and strengthening the positive effects of migration; and (c) protecting migrants' rights and ensuring their well-being. While all of the global migration initiatives cover these three major thematic clusters, there are different combinations of sub-themes that have been taken up by each initiative. Although not exhaustive, the comparative thematic mapping that follows thus highlights the main areas of convergence and divergences between the different initiatives.

## 3.1. Minimizing the negative aspects of migration: Addressing the drivers of forced and irregular migration

Addressing the drivers of migration underlies global migration initiatives either as a stand-alone thematic issue or as a horizontal one. For instance, the 2004 *IAMM* of the Berne Initiative explicitly recognized “the importance of the root causes of migration”.<sup>11</sup> In this respect, the 2006 HLD also highlighted the need to ensure that “people migrated out of choice rather than necessity”.<sup>12</sup> It observed that people often had to migrate because of poverty, conflict, human rights violations, poor governance or lack of employment.<sup>13</sup> In light of the unprecedented scale of migration worldwide, the 2016 New York Declaration more particularly “favour[s] an approach to addressing the drivers and root causes of large movements of refugees and migrants, including forced displacement and protracted crises [...]”.<sup>14</sup>

Environmental factors as drivers of migration have also been explicitly highlighted by the Berne Initiative, the GMG, the March 2011 IDM, the 2013 HLD and the 2016 New York Declaration. They have underlined the need to consider the impact of environmental factors – such as natural disasters, man-made catastrophes and ecological degradation<sup>15</sup> – on migration, while the Berne Initiative calls for implementation measures to reduce the incidence of natural disasters and related displacement.<sup>16</sup> Furthermore, both the GMG and the March 2011 IDM – dedicated to environmentally-induced migration – have emphasized the need for increased evidence-based analysis on environmental migration.<sup>17</sup>

11 Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 19.

12 2006 HLD, para. 9. See also the 2016 New York Declaration, para. 43.

13 2006 HLD, para. 9.

14 2016 New York Declaration, para. 12. Concerning migrants, see more specifically Annex II, para. 8(c).

15 Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 64; 2013 HLD, para. 25; and 2016 New York Declaration, para. 43.

16 Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 64.

17 GMG, *International Migration and Human Rights: Challenges and Opportunities on the Threshold of the 60th Anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, 2008, p. 84; March 2011 IDM on “Climate Change, Environmental Degradation and

Addressing irregular migration is regarded by the Berne Initiative, the GCIM and the 2006 HLD as an integral component of the management of regular migration, including through effective border control policies,<sup>18</sup> though not sufficient in themselves to eliminate irregular migration.<sup>19</sup> The GCIM also recommended addressing the demand for irregular migrant labour.<sup>20</sup> Despite this convergence, there is an important divergence regarding regular migration. The potential of opening up more legal avenues for migration is so far not addressed by all global migration initiatives, as it is only taken up by the GCIM, in a majority of IDM sessions and by some participants at the 2006 HLD.<sup>21</sup> “[T]he creation and expansion of regular pathways for migration” are currently foreseen in the 2016 New York Declaration as a potential feature of the forthcoming global compact to facilitate safe, orderly, regular and responsible migration in the forthcoming compact.<sup>22</sup>

Otherwise, irregular migration is more commonly tackled by global migration initiatives through the issue of migrant smuggling and trafficking in persons.<sup>23</sup> The Berne Initiative, the GCIM, the GMG, the 2009 IDM and the two HLDs make recommendations to strengthen cooperation for preventing migrant smuggling and human trafficking, as well as ratify and implement the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children and the Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air.<sup>24</sup>

## 3.2. Acknowledging and strengthening the positive effects of migration

Global migration initiatives regularly emphasize the positive effects of migration for countries of origin, countries of destination and the migrants themselves. They have tended to highlight its potential for development in countries of origin, although it is recognized that migration cannot be, of itself, the full answer to long-term development needs.<sup>25</sup> Greater emphasis has progressively been placed on the contribution that migration can make to sustainable development in the follow-up of the Millennium Development Goals and elaboration of the 2015 Sustainable Development Goals.<sup>26</sup> Remittances are an issue commonly addressed by global migration initiatives, which recommend improvements to money transfers

---

Migration”, Final Report, IDM No. 18, 2012, pp. 23–46.

18 Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 32; GCIM, 2005, p. 35; 2006 HLD, para. 17.

19 2006 HLD, para. 17.

20 GCIM, 2005, p. 36.

21 GCIM, 2005, p. 37, para. 27; November 2003 IDM on “Trade and Migration”, Final Report, *Managing the Movement of People: What Can Be Learned for Mode 4 of the GATS*, IDM No. 7, 2005, p. 40; September 2005 IDM on “Developing Capacity to Manage Migration”, in MC/8NF/279, 21 October 2005, para. 3; June 2007 IDM on “Free Movement of Persons in Regional Processes”, Final Report, IDM No. 13, 2010, p. 111; October 2007 IDM on “Making Global Labour Mobility a Catalyst for Development”, Final Report, IDM No. 12, 2010, p. 33; November 2007 IDM on “Migration Management in the Evolving Global Economy”, in MC/INF/289, 5 November 2007, para. 17; para. 3; September 2011 IDM on “Economic Cycles, Demographic Change and Migration”, Final Report, IDM No. 19, 2012, pp. 26–27; and 2006 HLD, para. 17, where some participants “argued for an increase in legal avenues for migration”.

22 2016 New York Declaration, Annex II, para. 8(e).

23 See for instance, 2016 New York Declaration, para. 34 and Annex II, para. 8(k).

24 Berne Initiative, 2005, pp. 43 and 44; GCIM, 2005, p. 39; GMG, 2008, pp. 65–67 and 69–71; March 2009 IDM on “Effective Respect for the Human Rights of Migrants: A Shared Responsibility”, Final Report, *Human Rights and Migration: Working Together for Safe, Dignified and Secure Migration*, IDM No. 16, 2010, pp. 73–83 and 90–93; 2006 HLD, para. 17; 2013 HLD, para. 17.

25 2006 HLD, para. 9.

26 Compare 2006 HLD, para. 9 with 2013 HLD, para. 8. See also GMG, *Conference Summary Report, International Conference, Harnessing Migration, Remittances and Diaspora Contributions for Financing Sustainable Development*, New York, USA, 26–27 May 2015; GFMD, “Strengthening Partnerships: Human Mobility for Sustainable Development” (Eighth Meeting of the GFMD), Istanbul, 14–16 October 2015; and GFMD, “Migration that Works for Sustainable Development of All: Towards a Transformative Migration Agenda” (Ninth Meeting of the GFMD), Dhaka, 10–12 December 2016. This now clearly transpires from the 2016 New York Declaration, para. 46.



and lowering remittance fees.<sup>27</sup> Fair recruitment practices, including reducing recruitment agencies' fees, were also highlighted by the Eighth GFMD Meeting and 2014 IDM as important to maximizing migrants' well-being and, by extension, development in countries of origin.<sup>28</sup>

The negative impacts or potential impacts of migration on the development of countries of origin are recurrent concerns. Both the Berne Initiative and the 2007 IDM<sup>29</sup> discussed ways and means of countering "brain drain", but more recent thinking focuses on temporary/circular migration of migrant workers and their (temporary and sometimes virtual) return.<sup>30</sup> Despite this change in focus, recommendations converge as to the need to facilitate the voluntary return and reintegration of migrants into their country of origin through, for instance, the portability of pensions,<sup>31</sup> and to improve transfer and exchange of knowledge and skills of highly skilled and other migrant workers.<sup>32</sup>

The positive impacts of migration on countries of destination are also acknowledged, in particular the potential for (temporary) labour migration to respond to labour market needs.<sup>33</sup> While emphasizing the benefits for countries of destination of attracting skilled migrant workers and capitalizing on the skills and entrepreneurship of the diaspora,<sup>34</sup> the Eighth GFMD Meeting in 2015 also underscored the need to further discuss the demand for lower-skilled labour in light of labour market needs and migration policies.<sup>35</sup> The 2003 and 2004 IDM, the Berne Initiative and the GCIM have also addressed the interrelationship between (temporary labour) migration and trade in the context of Mode 4 of the GATS.<sup>36</sup>

Recognizing that the rights of migrants, migration and development are thus closely interlinked, the 2005 IDM, the two HLDs, the GMG, the GFMD and the 2016 New York Declaration call for integrating international migration issues in development plans.<sup>37</sup> They also recommended that more evidence-based research be undertaken on the interrelationship between migration and development, including South–South migration,<sup>38</sup> and their impact on both countries of origin and destination,<sup>39</sup> and that partnerships be pursued, including with the private sector, for managing labour migration.<sup>40</sup>

27 Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 61; GCIM, 2005, pp. 16–29; 2006 HLD, para. 12; February 2005 IDM on "Migration and Development", Final Report, *Mainstreaming Migration into Development Policy Agendas*, IDM No. 8, 2005, p. 49; October 2007 IDM No. 12, p. 23; 2013 HLD, para. 27; GFMD, 2015, p. 4. See also the GMG recommendations at the May 2015 International Conference on Harnessing Migration, Remittances and Diaspora Contributions for Financing Sustainable Development, in GMG, 2015, pp. 6–8.

28 GFMD, 2015, p. 3; March 2014 IDM on "South-South Migration: Partnering Strategically for Development", Final Report, IDM No. 23, 2014, pp. 24–36.

29 Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 60; October 2007 IDM No. 12, p. 18.

30 GCIM, 2005, p. 31; 2006 HLD, paras. 13 and 14; 2013 HLD, para. 26; July 2008 IDM on "Enhancing the Role of Return Migration in Fostering Development", Final Report, IDM No. 15, 2010, pp. 57 and 58; September 2011 IDM No. 19, p. 14, recommendation 7; 2016 New York Declaration, para. 57 and Annex II, para. 8(q).

31 Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 60; GCIM, 2005, p. 31; July 2008 IDM No. 15.

32 Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 60; 2006 HLD, para. 13.

33 2006 HLD, para. 16.

34 GFMD, 2015, p. 6. See also Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 59; GCIM, 2005, pp. 29–31.

35 GFMD, 2015, p. 4.

36 November 2003 and October 2004 IDM No. 7 on "Trade and Migration"; Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 61; GCIM, 2005, p. 19.

37 2006 HLD, para. 9; IDM No. 8, 2005; and 2016 New York Declaration, para. 47. This issue was among the GMG priorities set out in its Multi-Annual Work Plan 2013–2015. See also GMG, *Mainstreaming Migration in Development Planning: A Handbook for Policy-Makers and Practitioners* (IOM, Denmark, 2010).

38 March 2014 IDM No. 23, p. 64.

39 October 2007 IDM No. 12, pp. 27 and 28; HLD 2013, para. 28. This issue was also among the GMG priorities in its Multi-Annual Work Plan 2013–2015.

40 October 2007 IDM No. 12, pp. 29–32; September 2011 IDM No. 19, p. 14, recommendation 5; GFMD, 2015, p. 6.

### 3.3. Protecting migrants' rights and ensuring their well-being

Protecting migrants' rights and ensuring their well-being are central features and objectives of all global migration initiatives analysed here. Indeed, they all reaffirm the need to promote and protect migrants' rights and fundamental freedoms, irrespective of their immigration status.<sup>41</sup> Particular attention is given to combating discrimination, racism and xenophobia, securing migrant workers' rights and labour standards, and protecting migrants from abuses, exploitation and human trafficking.<sup>42</sup>

Reference is thus regularly made to the importance of ratifying and implementing international human rights treaties, ILO conventions and instruments on human trafficking.<sup>43</sup> Support for the 1990 International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Migrant Workers Convention) is more nuanced. For instance, while an express call for ratification of the 1990 Convention was made at the 2006 HLD and in the 2016 New York Declaration,<sup>44</sup> the 2013 HLD only noted the contribution made by international instruments, including the 1990 Convention, to the protection of migrants.<sup>45</sup> At the Second GFMD Meeting in 2008, some delegates emphasized "the need to devise mechanisms to improve rates of ratification and implementation of the 1990 Convention".<sup>46</sup>

Special emphasis is placed on migrants in vulnerable situations. First, while an increasing proportion of migrants are females, women and girls are recognized to often be in a special and vulnerable situation. Global migration initiatives thus converge on the need for accrued attention to the protection of women and girls and for a gender-sensitive approach to managing migration.<sup>47</sup> Second, the same approach has been followed with respect to children as vulnerable, when migrating together with their families<sup>48</sup> or as separated or unaccompanied migrant children.<sup>49</sup> Third, victims of trafficking have been considered by all global migration initiatives as vulnerable and thus deserving specific protection.<sup>50</sup>

Fourth and finally, a new situation of vulnerability for migrants has been identified in recent years in global migration initiatives: migrants in crisis situations or "stranded migrants". The three IDM held in 2012 were devoted to migrants in crisis situations, emphasizing the need to strengthen the resilience of migrants' population.<sup>51</sup> The issue was subsequently addressed at the 2013 HLD where UN Member States recognized

41 See most notably: 2016 New York Declaration, para. 41; 2013 HLD, para. 10; March 2009 IDM No. 16, p. 12, lesson learned no. 4; GMG, 2008, p. 13.

42 See for instance, GMG, *Exploitation and Abuse of International Migrants, Particularly Those in an Irregular Situation: A Human Rights Approach*, GMG Thematic Paper (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2013); 2016 New York Declaration, Annex II, para. 8(u). Ensuring decent work was also among the GMG priorities set out in its Multi-Annual Work Plan 2013–2015.

43 The international legal framework applicable to migration has been the subject of a detailed study in the 2002 IDM Final Report, *International Legal Norms and Migration: An Analysis*, IDM No. 3 (IOM, Geneva, 2002), p. 34.

44 2006 HLD, para. 10; and 2016 New York Declaration, para. 48.

45 2013 HLD, para. 15.

46 GFMD, "Protecting and Empowering Migrants for Development", Report of the Proceedings (Second Meeting of the GFMD), Manila, 27–30 October 2008, p. 7.

47 See for instance: Berne Initiative, 2005, pp. 18 and 46; March 2009 IDM No. 16, paras. 34–36; GCIM, *Migration in an Interconnected World*, pp. 49–50; GMG, 2008, pp. 44–50; 2006 HLD, para. 16; GMFD, "Partnerships for Migration and Human Development – Shared Prosperity, Shared Responsibility" (Fourth Meeting of the GFMD), Puerto Vallarta, 8–11 November 2010, p. 22, recommendation 9; 2013 HLD, para. 11.

48 See for instance, October 2014 IDM on "Migration and Families", Final Report, IDM No. 24, 2015, esp. pp. 11 and 12.

49 See Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 46; GCIM, 2005, p. 50; 2006 HLD, para. 10; GMG, 2008, pp. 50–55; 2013 HLD, para. 13.

50 Berne Initiative, 2005, pp. 45–46; GMG, 2008, pp. 67–68; March 2009 IDM No. 16, pp. 83–90; GCIM, 2005, pp. 39–40; 2013 HLD, para. 17.

51 See April 2012 IDM on "Moving to Safety: Migration Consequences of Complex Crises", Final Report, IDM No. 20, 2012; September 2012 IDM on "Protecting Migrants during Times of Crisis: Immediate Responses and Sustainable Strategies", Final Report, IDM No. 21, 2012; and October 2012 IDM on "Migrants in Times of Crisis: An Emerging Protection Challenge", Summary Report, February 2013.

“[...] the importance of coordinated efforts of the international community to assist and support migrants stranded in vulnerable situations and facilitate, and cooperate on when appropriate, their voluntary return to their country of origin, and call for practical and action-oriented initiatives aimed at identifying and closing protection gaps”.<sup>52</sup>

As recognized by all global migration initiatives, integration is also important for ensuring the well-being of migrants. As the GCIM recommended in its 2005 report, “Authorized and long-term migrants should be fully integrated in society. The integration process should value social diversity, foster social cohesion and avert the marginalization of migrant communities.”<sup>53</sup> The 2010 IDM, the 2013 HLD and the Eighth GFMD Meeting in 2015 have recognized in this respect the need to improve public perceptions of migrants and migration.<sup>54</sup> Issues related to regularization of stay for irregular migrants present on the territory of host States and naturalization of long-term migrants are not addressed in depth by global migration initiatives, as they pertain to the sovereign rights of States. Nevertheless, “[c]onsideration of policies to regularize the status of migrants” is expressly referred to in Annex II of the 2016 New York Declaration concerning the future global compact.<sup>55</sup> Beforehand, the 2002 IDM recalled the limits placed by human rights law, especially through principles of non-discrimination and procedural fairness.<sup>56</sup> The Berne Initiative also noted some effective practices with regard to naturalization and nationality, such as “linking nationality policies including naturalization with immigration and integration programmes”,<sup>57</sup> while the GCIM recommended regularization of irregular migrants on a case-by-case basis.<sup>58</sup>

52 2013 HLD, para. 23. The protection of stranded migrants was also among the GMG priorities set out in its Multi-Annual Work Plan 2013–2015, and reference is expressly made to “migrants in countries in crisis” in the 2016 New York Declaration, Annex II, para. 8(n).

53 GCIM, 2005, p. 44. See similarly, July 2006 IDM on “Migrants and the Host Society”, Final Report, IDM No. 11, 2008.

54 March 2010 IDM on “Migration and Transnationalism: Opportunities and Challenges”, Final Report; *Migration and Social Change*, IDM No. 17, 2011, p. 15; 2013 HLD, para. 9; GFMD, 2015, p. 6.

55 2016 New York Declaration, Annex II, para. 8(p).

56 2002 IDM No. 3, p. 47.

57 Berne Initiative, 2005, p. 53.

58 GCIM, 2005, p. 39, para. 35.



## Lessons learned for the way forward

This comparative thematic mapping demonstrates that global migration initiatives converge on a substantial number of sub-thematic issues through the three main common thematic clusters identified:

- (a) **Minimizing the negative aspects of migration:** The focus is commonly placed on tackling the traditional drivers of forced and irregular migration, such as poverty, human rights violations and armed conflicts, and addressing irregular migration through, most notably, border control policies and preventing/combating human trafficking and migrant smuggling.
- (b) **Strengthening the positive effects of migration:** When it comes to countries of origin, global migration initiatives primarily focus on remittances and fair recruitment practices, as well as mitigation of the negative impact of migration by facilitating the voluntary return and reintegration of migrants and improving knowledge and skills transfers. For countries of destination, the attention is focused on (temporary) labour migration, the potential of the diaspora, as well as, to a certain extent, the interrelationship between migration and trade (Mode 4 of the GATS). More broadly, there is agreement on integrating migration issues into development planning, the need for more evidence-based research on the interrelationship between migration and development and the role of partnerships for managing labour migration.
- (c) **Protecting migrants' rights and ensuring their well-being:** Sub-thematic issues under this thematic cluster highlight the need to promote and respect migrants' rights, most notably through combating discrimination, racism and xenophobia, securing migrant workers' rights and labour standards and protecting migrants from abuses, exploitation and human trafficking. The importance of ratifying and implementing international human rights treaties, ILO conventions and instruments on human trafficking is commonly acknowledged. The focus is also placed on migrants in vulnerable situations and more specifically women and girls, children and victims of human trafficking. Integration in the host country is also commonly emphasized as essential for the well-being of migrants.

Beyond these thematic areas of convergence, there exist also thematic divergences among the global migration initiatives analysed in this paper and reproduced in Table 2.

**Table 2:** Divergences among global migration initiatives

Minimizing the negative aspects of migration	Strengthening the positive effects of migration	Protecting migrants' rights and ensuring their well-being
Environmental drivers of migration	Migration and sustainable development from "brain drain" to temporary/circular migration	Stranded migrants
Opening-up of regular migration channels	Low-skilled labour	Ratification of the 1990 Migrant Workers Convention

Some of these divergences (see items on the second row) in Table 2 can be explained by the fact that these initiatives evolve to take account of new migratory and policy challenges. This is illustrated through four main thematic trends that have emerged through the years:

- (a) Increasing attention given to **environmental drivers of migration**, such as natural disasters, man-made catastrophes and ecological degradation, accelerated by climate change;
- (b) Recognition of the interrelationship between migration and **sustainable development** with the transition from the Millennium Development Goals (from which migration was absent) to the 2015 Sustainable Development Goals;
- (c) A shift away from focusing only on the “brain drain” impact of migration on countries of origin to now recognizing the costs and benefits of emigration to countries of origin, with emphasis on improving the benefits through **temporary and/or circular migration**; and
- (d) A new focus on the vulnerability of migrants in situations of crisis, the so-called **stranded migrants**.

On the other hand, other thematic divergences (see items on the third row) in Table 2 underlie more inherent tension points between global migration initiatives. From the comparative thematic mapping, there appears to be three main issues on which agreement is not yet achieved:

- (a) **Recommendations for opening up more legal avenues for migration:** The potential of such new legal migration pathways is acknowledged by some global migration initiatives, while recommendations in this regard are more limited.
- (b) **Consideration of low-skilled labour migration outside temporary migration policies:** Most global migration initiatives consider low-skilled labour migration through temporary migration policies and not as a sub-thematic issue on its own.
- (c) **Ratification and implementation of the 1990 Migrant Workers Convention:** There appears to be a strong disconnect in attitudes towards international human rights, labour and human trafficking/smuggling instruments, on the one hand, and the 1990 Convention, on the other hand. Global migration initiatives expressly recommend ratification of the former but only few do so for the 1990 Convention, which has a relatively low ratification rate and is to date not ratified by major countries of destination.

Lessons are without doubt to be learned from these thematic convergences, trends and tension points in framing the way forward, and most notably the global compact.<sup>59</sup> However, to do so to the fullest extent, more knowledge-based research would be needed on the subject. Indeed, comprehensive thematic research on global migration initiatives is currently lacking. This may be due to the inherent difficulties attached to such an exercise, as information, recommendations and proposals are scattered among a wide variety of reports, statements and documents adopted by diverse initiatives. Moreover, there is also a lack of attention to the subsequent implementation of recommendations and proposals made by global migration initiatives. While more evidence-based research on implementation is needed, many, if not most, of these initiatives are explicitly framed as non-binding, and thus lack any clear implementation action plan that could be followed by States and other stakeholders and against which implementation could be subsequently assessed.

<sup>59</sup> For a summary of these thematic convergences, trends and key tension points, see Annex II.



# Annexes

## Annex I: List of global and regional migration initiatives and other processes

<b>Global</b>	<p>Berne Initiative (2001) International Organization for Migration's International Dialogue on Migration (2001–present) Doyle Report (2002) Coordination meeting on International Migration, United Nations Population Division of the Department of Economic and Social Affairs (2002–present) Global Commission on International Migration (2003) International Labour Conferences (2004 and 2014) Global Migration Group (2006–present) First and Second High-level Dialogues on International Migration and Development (2006 and 2013) Global Forum on Migration and Development (2007–present) Migrants in Countries in Crisis Initiative (2014–present) UN Summit for Refugees and Migrants (2016)</p>
<b>Regional (RCPs)</b>	<p>Intergovernmental Consultations on Migration, Asylum and Refugees Central-American Commission of Migration Directors (Comisión Centroamericana de Directores de Migración) Budapest Process Regional Conference on Migration (Puebla Process) Inter-Governmental Asia-Pacific Consultations on Refugees, Displaced Persons and Migrants Pacific Immigration Directors' Conference South American Conference on Migration (Lima Process) Migration Dialogue for Southern Africa Cross-Border Cooperation Process (Söderköping Process, now integrated within the Eastern Partnership Panel on Migration and Asylum) Migration Dialogue for West Africa Hague Process on Refugees and Migration Regional Ministerial Conference on Migration in the Western Mediterranean (5+5 Dialogue) Bali Process on People Smuggling, Trafficking in Persons and Related Transnational Crime Mediterranean Transit Migration Dialogue Ministerial Consultation on Overseas Employment and Contractual Labour for Countries of Origin in Asia (Colombo Process) Migration, Asylum, Refugees Regional Initiative Euro-African Dialogue on Migration and Development (Rabat Process) Intergovernmental Authority on Development – Regional Consultative Process on Migration Ministerial Consultations on Overseas Employment and Contractual Labour for Countries of Origin and Destination in Asia (Abu Dhabi Dialogue) Eastern Partnership Panel on Migration and Asylum Migration Dialogue for Central African States Almaty Process on Refugee Protection and International Migration Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA) Regional Consultative Process (Migration Dialogue for COMESA Member States) Intra-Regional Forum on Migration in Africa (Pan-African Forum) Arab Regional Consultative Process</p>

## Annex II: Summary of key thematic convergences, trends and tension points

<b>Areas of convergence</b>	Minimizing the negative aspects of migration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Tackling the drivers of forced and irregular migration: poverty, human rights violations and armed conflicts</li> <li>- Addressing irregular migration through effective border control policies</li> <li>- Cooperating in preventing and combating human trafficking and smuggling</li> <li>- Ratifying and implementing the Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling Protocols</li> </ul>	
	Strengthening the positive effects of migration	For countries of origin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Improving money transfers and lowering remittances fees</li> <li>- Ensuring fair recruitment practices, including reducing recruitment agencies' fees</li> <li>- Facilitating voluntary return and reintegration of migrants</li> <li>- Improving transfers of knowledge and skills of highly skilled and other migrants</li> </ul>
		For host countries	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Capitalizing on (temporary) labour migration to meet labour market's needs</li> <li>- Attracting skilled migrant workers</li> <li>- Capitalizing on the skills and entrepreneurship of the diaspora</li> <li>- Interrelationship between migration and trade (Mode 4 of the GATS)</li> </ul>
		In general	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Integrating migration issues into development planning</li> <li>- Need for more evidence-based research on the interrelationship between migration and development</li> <li>- Improving partnerships for managing labour migration, including with the private sector</li> </ul>
Protecting migrants' rights and ensuring their well-being	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Combating discrimination, racism and xenophobia</li> <li>- Securing migrants workers' rights and labour standards</li> <li>- Protecting migrants from abuses, exploitation and human trafficking</li> <li>- Ratifying and implementing core international human rights treaties, ILO conventions and instruments on human trafficking</li> <li>- Treating women and girls, children and victims of human trafficking as migrants in vulnerable situations requiring special protection</li> <li>- Integrating (long-term) migrants in society</li> </ul>		
<b>Thematic trends</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Environmental drivers of migration (e.g. natural disasters, man-made catastrophes and ecological degradation)</li> <li>- From development to sustainable development and the role of migration</li> <li>- From brain drain to temporary and/or circular migration</li> <li>- Stranded migrants as migration in a vulnerable situation</li> </ul>		
<b>Key tension points</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Recommendation for opening up more legal avenues for migration</li> <li>- Consideration of low-skilled labour migration outside temporary migration policies</li> <li>- Ratification and implementation of the 1990 International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families</li> </ul>		







**Céline Bauloz** is a senior fellow at the Global Migration Centre, Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies (Geneva) and managing editor of the *Refugee Survey Quarterly*, published by the Oxford University Press. Céline has worked as visiting professor at the University of Bocconi (Milan) and visiting researcher at Harvard Law School (Cambridge, Massachusetts) and regularly acts as consultant for international and non-governmental organizations. She now works as a Migration Law specialist in the International Migration Law Unit of the International Organization for Migration.